

Fiscal Year 2017 Report of December 13, 2017 Closed Meeting  
of the Office of the Secretary of Defense Reserve Forces Policy Board  
Under Section 10(d) of the Federal Advisory Committee Act

1. The Reserve Forces Policy Board (RFPB) held a quarterly meeting in the Pentagon, Washington, DC on December 13, 2017 in Room 3E863.
  
2. A portion of the meeting was closed to the public from 8:15 a.m. to 12:05 p.m. The meeting was closed in accordance with provisions outlined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, as amended by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), as amended by 5 U.S.C. Appendix (Executive Order 13526 – Classified National Security Information). The agenda items covered during this period were the presentations from The Under Secretary of the U.S. Army (USA), Commander, US Northern Command, The Deputy Secretary of Defense, and U.S. Cyber Command. Secret level discussions are likely as they address the military operations; readiness, availability, use, and performance of the National Guard and Reserve; and the future strategies for their use. The unclassified summary of each of the presentations is provided below:

a. **The Honorable Ryan D. McCarthy**  
**-Under Secretary of the U.S. Army (USA)**

- USA McCarthy opened his talk with a quote from Abraham Lincoln telling General Ulysses Grant he must “Focus on the mission, I’ll take care of the politics” which is also his message to the force in the modern age. He further outlined an Army vision to fuse roles and responsibilities of multiple headquarters and agencies to increase efficiency and expand processes without creating new structure to do it.
  
- USA McCarthy discussed the need for modernizing weapons systems by highlighting the age of the “Big 5” hardware systems that supported Air Land Battle doctrine (UH-60, Bradley, M-1 Abrams, Patriot Missile system, and Apache AH-64). He stated that Future Combat Systems and Future Vertical Lift require full funding to maintain Army lethality and peer to peer overmatch.
  
- He stated that DoD Army political appointed positions in the Pentagon are less than half filled, and this is a challenge for effectively managing and resourcing the Army. He also said that requirements are increasing around the world at a pace far exceeding capacity, and that he will stop asking for more money when they stop asking for the Army.
  
- USA McCarthy stated that they are standing up more Security Force Assistance Brigades – 5 in the AC and 1 in the Army National Guard. He highlighted that we must maintain enough force structure in Europe to be a credible deterrent while reducing our Middle Eastern presence.
  
- Dr. Bensahel asked how will the Army mobilize in future conflict to levels not seen in generations? USA McCarthy stated that they are working on mobilization plans and increasing the number of mobilization platforms (installations) from 2 to about a dozen.

**b. General Lori Robinson**  
**-USAF, Commander, US Northern Command**

- Gen Lori Robinson briefed the RFPB on the North American Aerospace Defense Command (NORAD) and United States NORTHERN COMMAND, or NORTHCOM. She summarized the two commands and explained the differences of the two commands, their missions and organization, and the challenges they face today.
- She stated that NORAD and NORTHCOM are two unique commands in their structures, in their assigned missions, and in the authorities governing both commands.
- As Commander of both organizations, General Robinson stated that she wears multiple hats and has multiple reporting chains. She said that with the different hats mean different roles and missions with different authorities. She noted impact of the bi-national agreement throughout the command, with the NORAD agreement stipulating that the NORAD Deputy will always be a Canadian officer with the NORAD Commander from the U.S.
- She then said that she would describe NORAD and NORTHCOM separately, then bring discussion of the commands back together. She then explained that the command has a long history of defense cooperation between Canada & the United States, going back to the Ogdensburg Declaration (1940) between Prime Minister King & President Roosevelt.
- As for NORAD, Gen Robinson mentioned that it was born of the Cold War, but shaped by 9/11. She said that Article 1 of the 2006 NORAD Agreement, which is the latest one signed by both governments, assigns three missions to NORAD: Aerospace Warning, Aerospace Control, and Maritime Warning, however; these missions are not mutually exclusive in their execution and most of the time one mission will drive the other on the time continuum.
- She stated that NORAD is a bi-national command with the U.S. and Canada established in 1958, and that the NORAD Agreement is a formal military partnership, based upon a binding international agreement.
- As the Commander of NORAD Gen Robinson has 2 bosses. She said that she not only reports to the U.S. President through the Secretary of Defense, but that she also reports to the Prime Minister of Canada through the Canadian Chief of Defense Staff (CDS) and the Minister of National Defense. Gen Robinson said that she even had to interview with the CDS before her nomination could move forward to the Senate.
- Gen Robinson stated that NORAD has 3 regions, with 2 regions geographically located in the U.S.A. and led by American 3-star Generals with Canadian Deputy Commanders and the 1 region located in Canada and led by a Canadian 2-star General, with an American as the Deputy Commander. Relationships across all 3 regions are important. She said that they have good communication between the regions and with the strength of the bi-national command agreement, the regions work well together. Gen Robinson briefed that USNORTHCOM is a U.S. geographic combatant command established in 2002 because of 9/11.

- She briefed that their Area of Responsibility (AOR) includes all air, land and sea approaches to North America, encompassing the continental U.S., Alaska, Canada, Mexico and the surrounding water areas out 500 nautical miles. She also stated that the NORTHCOM missions are Homeland Defense (HD), Defense Support of Civil Authorities (DSCA), and Theater Security Cooperation (TSC).
- She explained the distinction between missions for North America and within the United States as related to Homeland Defense (HD), Defense Support of Civil Authorities (DSCA), and Theater Security Cooperation (TSC).

c. **The Honorable Patrick M. Shanahan**  
**-Deputy Secretary of Defense**

- Secretary Shanahan began his discussion with the Board by describing his past positions in the business world, and how this experience can benefit the Department. He stated that as a former executive with Boeing, he has experience in improving large organizations and managing large, complex programs.
- The remainder of Mr. Shanahan's comments focused on two areas: strategy, budgeting, execution, and utilizing the whole of government approach in addressing our country's challenges. Regarding strategy, he said that the Secretary has been focused on developing the new National Defense Strategy rather quickly because he wants to make sure it can be used during this term and that it will be complimentary to the National Security Strategy. It will also set specific guidelines and goals for the Department and will also address readiness and define where capability and capacity will be applied. Mr. Shanahan briefed that the strategy also drives the budget, which he is optimistic about. He anticipates using the first quarter of CY 2018 to translate the strategy into guidance.
- Secretary Shanahan also talked about changes and improvement to execution. He is overseeing a restructuring effort which will change the organization for the long term, specifically with business processes. The Services will be incentivized to operate smartly and save money. He also intends to streamline the contracting process, targeting IT and healthcare first.
- Finally, Secretary Shanahan discussed the importance of using the whole of government. He stated that it was important to build the right relationships with other governmental agencies to ensure they are collectively attacking the Nation's problems.
- Secretary Shanahan finished his time with the Board by answering questions. Chairman Punaro asked about the streamlining processes and reducing overhead by combining processes, specifically in areas like human resources and healthcare, among the Services. Mr. Shanahan stated that DoD standards should be the same across the Services and where there are areas where processes are the same, perhaps they should look at standardizing them.

- d. **Major General Sheila Zuehlke**
- e. **RDML David Dermanelian**  
**-USCYBERCOM**

- During the closed session, Maj Gen Zuehlke reviewed findings from the 2014 RFPB Cyber Task Force noting that the focus on the Cyber Mission Force, which is only a small part of DoD cyber operations. She then introduce RDML Dermanelian to provide a brief on Cyber training Structures and initiatives.
- RDML Dermanelian discussed USCYBERCOM's cyber training and certification program, noting an imperative from the CYBERCOM Commander to integrate Reserve Component forces across the spectrum of cyber operations. He noted that the National Guard brings state and industry partners, but that more work must be done to integrate these partners in an unclassified environment.
- He summarized the Persistent Cyber Training Environment, which will provide standardized baseline training and capability while allowing for home station training, which is critical for Reserve Component recruiting and retention.
- RDML Dermanelian also covered some of the remaining questions and issues for further development of Reserve Component cyber capabilities, to include the role of forces under state authority and how those forces could or should coordinate with USCYBERCOM.



Arnold L. Punaro  
Major General, USMCR (Ret)  
Chairman, Reserve Forces Policy Board